

# Introduction

Barbara J. Thayer-Bacon, PhD

*University of Tennessee, Knoxville*

## The Background

In 1994 Lynda Stone published an outstanding collection of feminist writers who were writing about feminist theory and pedagogy in connection to educational theory and practice.<sup>1</sup> Right around the same time, Barbara Thayer-Bacon developed a “Feminist Epistemology and Education” course that she began teaching at Bowling Green State University (BGSU). This course employed Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule’s *Women’s Ways of Knowing* as the starting point, continuing with the articles and essays of current work in feminist epistemology (which eventually evolved to using Thayer-Bacon’s own book, *Relational “(e)pistemologies,”*) and ending with Lynda Stone’s edited book, *The Education Feminism Reader*.<sup>2</sup> The course was cross-listed with Women’s Studies and Educational Foundations and Inquiry, and offered graduate students a possible course toward a graduate certificate in Women’s Studies. Students from various programs across the campus such as American Studies and Communications Studies took the course and found the connections between feminist theory and educational theory important and exciting.

When Thayer-Bacon was hired by the University of Tennessee (UT) in 2000, she found that there was a shortage of course options available to graduate students who wanted a certificate in Women’s Studies, which was offered at UT as well. This was especially the case for students earning degrees in the College of Education. She introduced her “Feminist Epistemology and Education” course (CSE 609) to the UT curriculum, and when another feminist scholar joined the Cultural Studies in Education program, the title of the course was broadened to “Feminist Theory and Education” so either one of us could teach CSE 609, and each offer our own unique course design. Thayer-Bacon continues to follow the same list of readings for her course, as it has been very successful and students’ feedback continues to be that they are not being exposed to this material in other courses. The readings provide the students a foundational base in feminist theories in education, and many students have gone on to use the works in diverse and creative ways for their own scholarly projects. Over the past eighteen years, Thayer-Bacon has witnessed many students shape master’s theses and doctoral dissertations around various

scholarship that is included in the course, which is exciting indeed. The last several years CSE 609 has been offered, Stone's *The Education Feminism Reader* has become harder and harder to find as it is now out of print. Students have been able to find copies through on-line purchases, but this has become more difficult each year. Thayer-Bacon's students have pretty much bought up what is available. She began to worry that once again women's work was going to no longer be available for students, and that once again we would find ourselves having to recover important feminist work that was lost to public knowledge. That concern is what originally motivated her to seek a way to republish the book, *The Education Feminism Reader*.

Katharine Sprecher (Thayer-Bacon's Graduate Assistant at the time) worked with Thayer-Bacon on updating our feminist reading list for CSE 609 to include work from this past decade to add to the readings, thinking they would at least have these to use in the next teaching of CSE 609. We wanted to make sure students understand that this work is continuing, and they too can add to the scholarship on feminist theory and education. At the end of the fall semester, 2010, students in CSE 609 were polled for their feedback, and they all requested that we *not* lose the current, what we are now calling the classic selections in Stone's *The Education Feminism Reader*. The students in CSE 609 wanted us instead to *add* to what is already there (there were 18 students in the course from various programs across the campus, including Nursing, Sports Studies, Child and Family Studies, Applied Educational Psychology, as well as Cultural Studies in Education). Sprecher and Thayer-Bacon searched for another text to use instead of *The Education Feminism Reader*, but we have not been able to find anything. What we find are collections of important feminist theory essays, classic and contemporary, but not feminist theory that relates directly to educational issues. The book Lynda Stone published in 1994 is unique and there is nothing like it on the market that can be used directly in a College of Education feminist theory course.

As Stone (1994) so eloquently describes in her original Introduction: "(t)he title *The Education Feminism Reader* names a new theoretical formulation and is itself a claiming in the tradition of Adrienne Rich" (who is quoted in her opening, in Rich's speech that calls for women to claim an education rather than receive one<sup>3</sup>). "The claim for education feminism is important because of the special conditions that surround the lives of women in professional education. 'Professional education' is the arena most closely associated with the lives of most of the authors of this collection and with the feminist issues about which they write. It also names as a significant category teaching candidates and education graduate students, pre-collegiate practicing teachers and administrators, teacher educators and education researchers. . . . The structural context of women and feminism in professional education is especially complex given that as a distinct institution it is highly 'feminized,' that is, populated primarily by women" (pp. 1–2).

"Any institution in which women are predominant, common sense dictates, ought to be relatively free of discrimination against its majority. Such, in subtle and not so subtle ways, is not the case for women in professional education" (pp. 1–2). Stone goes on to describe discrimination that has several institutional locations: one—in pre-collegiate schools in the form of the patriarchy within which the practitioner works, two—in col-

leges and universities where feminists are mistrusted by teachers out in the field because they do not work in the schools and are not considered “real scholars” because they are not viewed as members of the general academy, and three—in the devaluing of feminist work within higher education by not only “pure scholars” but also by “applied scholars” and by their academic sisters (p. 2).

“An initiating point: the education feminist scholarship of this book, representative of an emerging and already vigorous field of study and practice, seeks to demonstrate its own evolving history and attempts to influence future education and feminist theory and practice” (p. 3).

Sprecher and Thayer-Bacon have honed down the original list of readings from Stone’s collection to the one’s most responded to and used by students in CSE 609 in the past, and we have simplified the way the readings are divided, in terms of basic categories to help instructors with their grouping of the material for reading assignments. We then began reading and selecting material to include in a Contemporary Readings section. We don’t want our students to think feminist work is over, or passé. We want them to see how third wave feminist criticism in the 1990s has had an impact on feminist work, and that this work continues today in diverse and exciting ways. Thayer-Bacon approached Stone in spring, 2011, on the idea of redoing *The Education Feminism Reader* with a classics and contemporary section, and she was interested in the project and willing to support our efforts. Since she is the one who put together the original collection, with help from her graduate assistant, it is only fitting that she be listed as one of the editors. Sprecher should also be listed, as she has done much to search for possibilities and help with the reading and selecting process as well as the indexing. Thayer-Bacon is heading up the project as she wants the book available to use in her course. We all strongly support the continuing development of education feminist theory.

## The Features

*Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* is a rich collection of important essays feminist scholars have contributed to the field of education. The collection now begins with 1982 and continues to 2011. The authors are once again college and university professors teaching primarily in programs, departments, schools, and colleges of education located in the United States, Canada, Europe, and New Zealand. They are diverse in their ethnic backgrounds as well as their discipline backgrounds, including philosophy, psychology, sociology, and curriculum studies. The individual essays are concise and well written, and the collection is arranged in such a way that it is easy for instructors to assign various essays around themes of their own choosing, or allow the students to choose which ones they are interested in reading and present them to the class. Thayer-Bacon assigns 3–4 readings per week that we all read, then in class she has the students form small groups for discussion of a particular essay that stirred them, then we get back into a large group discussion to share various topics and issues that students may want to write about for

a position paper. *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* format is great for using with graduate students in various programs as they find it accessible, and yet it also offers high quality scholarship, and numerous sources for topics and issues students will want to pursue on their own.

Professors will find *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* is a valuable text to add to their class list of books. Due to its high quality of selected essays and their significant treatment of major current feminist theories, it is possible to use *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* as a central text in a course on feminist theory and education, and then give students assignments to research individual scholars on their own.

*Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* is timely, and forward thinking, with its addition of a new section of contemporary work from the past decade, as well as addressing major theories from the past that have contributed to our current feminist theories, as we have chosen essays for the contemporary section that reference earlier feminist work by the scholars included in the “classics” section. Indeed, some of the scholars have essays in both sections. In this way, a conversation continues, and we can see that feminist theories continue to grow and further develop. The timely quality of this book will make it possible for students to not only be aware of the history of feminist theory as it relates to education, but also help them understand current issues and concerns being debated. From a professorial standpoint, this is also an attractive feature as current perspectives are usually in article or paper form, rarely found in one text, as they will be presented here.

*Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* will be a valuable book for professors to use in graduate courses that consider feminist theory, especially in relation to education, as a topic. This includes at least people who teach graduate courses in philosophy of education, curriculum theory, women’s studies, and cultural studies. *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* is intended to make a significant contribution to scholarship in the field of educational theory, from diverse feminist perspectives across all fields of study that seek to include feminist work. Examples are: nursing, social work, child and family studies, women’s studies, sports studies, as well as educational studies. Feminist theory has a wide reach and is applicable to most fields of study and educational issues also have a wide reach, giving *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* a broad market. However, the market becomes even broader when we recognize that *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* addresses critical multicultural educational issues and has an inclusive, diverse selection of feminist scholars that bring race, class, sexual orientation, religious practices, and colonial/post-colonial perspectives to bear on their theory. A critical multicultural educational focus makes this text relevant to faculty in teacher education programs who teach future teachers multicultural educational issues and policy makers who address policy issues regarding schools and diverse cultural populations. It will also be relevant to teachers, parents, and administrators who work in culturally diverse settings and whose children attend such settings.

As a final outstanding feature of *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings*, it is our goal to offer support to feminist theories that are making significant

contributions to the scholarly discussion on gender and education. *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings* is a text that graduate students and scholars in the field of feminist theory will want to read for its scholarly value and the contributions it makes toward furthering our understanding of gender. We predict that this is a book people will want to keep on their shelves and refer to throughout their careers.

## The Classics Frame

In the Classics Section, we have subdivided the retained readings into two basic categories, “Education and Schooling,” and “Teaching and Pedagogy.” We have retained the scholars who brought important diverse perspectives to the original text as well as strong scholarly contributions, as can be measured by how often their work is cited in other feminist scholarship. Essays that were prior to 1982 we have dropped, so that the classics section covers the time frame of 1982–1993 (the original text was published in 1994). We have tried to balance the maintaining of most of the original collection with concerns that the text not become too large and costly. At the same time, we want to reach a wide audience as we think this work has a wide range of interest and applicability.

Our classics selection now includes:

### *Classics*

#### Part I. *Education and Schooling*

- Madeleine Arnot, “Male Hegemony, Social Class, and Women’s Education” (1982)  
 Jane Roland Martin, “Excluding Women from the Educational Realm” (1982)  
 Bonnie Thornton Dill, “Race, Class, and Gender: Prospects for an All-Inclusive Sisterhood” (1983)  
 Ruth Enid Zambrana, “Toward Understanding the Educational Trajectory and Socialization of Latina Women” (1988)  
 Madeleine R. Grumet, “Conception, Contradiction, and Curriculum” (1988)  
 Barbara McKellar, “Only the Fittest of the Fittest Will Survive: Black Women and Education” (1989)

#### Part II. *Teaching and Pedagogy*

- Lynda Stone, “Toward a Transformational Theory of Teaching” (1988)  
 Nel Noddings, “An Ethic of Caring and Its Implications for Instructional Arrangements” (1988)  
 Patti Lather, “The Absent Presence: Patriarchy, Capitalism, and the Nature of Teacher Work” (1987)  
 Sue Middleton, “Schooling and Radicalisation: Life Histories of New Zealand Feminist Teachers” (1987)

- Elizabeth Ellsworth, "Why Doesn't This Feel Empowering?: Working through the Repressive Myths of Critical Pedagogy" (1989)
- Joyce E. King, "Dysconscious Racism: Ideology, Identity, and the Miseducation of Teachers" (1991)
- Deanne Bogdan, "When is a Singing School (Not) a Chorus?: The Emancipatory Agenda in Feminist Pedagogy and Literature Education" (1993)

## CHAPTER OVERVIEW

What follows is a brief description of each chapter as described in Stone's original Introduction, but reordered to follow our new classics structure (pp. 9–12). We have pulled together the essays that take up schools and education as institutions within which women have been denied equality into Part I. "Authors herein claim that this inequality relates to broader male-defined norms arising from the role of the family during industrialization, the definitions of gender and of education, and the relationship of class and gender to schooling" (p. 9).

Madeleine Arnot offers the first "critical" piece to the collection in an important theorizing from British "new sociology of knowledge." Here the relationship of social class is added to that of gendered education. With much distinction, Arnot poses an early critique of social reproduction theory, and concepts like hegemony and contradiction are used. For Arnot, gender becomes a social construction that is at once arbitrary and nonessentialist, and based on difference.

Jane Roland Martin's classic chapter takes up the place of women in the philosophy of education. In an account that later is part of her important book, Martin (also a founder of the field) traces the conception of education from ancient times and finds women excluded. This account is complemented by an analysis of the meanings of education, liberal education, and teaching from recent analytic philosophy of education. To the standard picture are added the gendered lives of women.

Bonnie Thornton Dill makes a significant contribution with her sociological history of sisterhood and the feminist movement and their places in African-American women's experience. Dill overviews a conception of sisterhood for Black women, relates the struggle against racial injustice for women and men of color, offers the initial critique of white feminism in this book, and poses strategies for a more all-inclusive sisterhood.

Ruth Enid Zambrana adds the perspective of Latina women to issues of education and socialization. In an acknowledged working from Dill's theorizing, Zambrana traces the lack of studies about the lives of women who are *not* white and middle-class and adds her own critique of feminist theory. This is followed by a suggestive model that builds in culture along with the relationships of gender, race, class, and language in understanding the choices for educational lives.

Madeleine R. Grumet's chapter introduces yet another strand of educational theory in her "reconceptualization" of curriculum in terms of the lives of women. Herein the term "reproduction" assumes both a biological and a phenomenological sense as it is tied

to education. Grumet revisits Chodorow and makes salient psychoanalytic theory prior to that of Walkerdine. Contradiction also plays a part in the curriculum “of the fathers” and in a call for another, feminist, conception.

Barbara McKellar presents an unusual perspective on the diversity of women teachers, that as a black woman who is a teacher educator in Britain. McKellar documents and discusses the way that structures of both society and knowledge influence the success of black people in education. The central role of black women in the family and wider community is a related topic. Issues for teachers include access to higher education, pedagogical interests, and promotion.

Part II of the classics section “takes up theorizations of who teaches and how. Again, previous topics intersect but in new ways: questions of identity, conditions of education, theories of knowledge as they influence conceptions of teachers and teaching.” Diversity of perspectives continue in these eight essays. “These perspectives come from philosophy, history, sociology, and curriculum theory, as well as from empirical and non-empirical research. Each paper, working from many others in the book, presents a critique of standard, nonfeminist theorization.”

Lynda Stone posits a transformation of teaching theory based in an understanding of its philosophical roots. Objective and subjective models of education found analogous conceptions of teaching. Both, however, are male-defined, as Stone’s gender critique reveals. A new conception related to the work of Martin and Noddings is proposed, a conception based not in a dualistic, but rather in a relational, feminist epistemology.

Nel Noddings introduces the now famous “ethic of caring” in her chapter. Writing in the field of philosophy rather than a more dominant psychology, this senior author in education feminism begins from a moral orientation to education, teaching, and instructional arrangements. She posits the need to change almost every aspect of present schooling, a change that should be centered in the ethical relation between each teacher and student. Two important elements are dialogue and confirmation.

Patti Lather continues the strand of ‘critical theory’ in the book with her important critique of the nature of teacher work as it relates to feminism, Marxism, and capitalism. Lather begins with a review of neo-Marxist research in education and points to the general absence of gender. As a source for theoretical reformulation Lather considers ‘Marxist feminism,’ as a perspective that takes on issues for teachers that involve the public-private split, subjectivity, and the danger of reductionism.

Sue Middleton utilizes the methodology of sociological life history research in her interesting chapter about the school experiences of two feminist teachers in New Zealand. One has a British background and the other is Maori with adopted Pakeha (European-background) parents. Each tells her story about postwar education and becoming a feminist radical teacher. Each describes her own experience of discrimination and marginality. Middleton concludes with implications for feminist pedagogy.

Elizabeth Ellsworth’s chapter is identified as one of the most significant in education feminism today (at the time of Stone’s writing, 1993–94), coming out of critical, post-structural theory. Ellsworth poses a critique of ‘critical pedagogy’ that is based in her own university teaching, a critique of what she came to recognize as subtle repressive

elements of empowerment, student voice, dialogue, and critical reflection. What emerges is a pedagogical vision constituted of multiple contexts and perspectives.

Joyce E. King's chapter is the only one of the (original) collection that is not feminist in intent. Rather it points by implication to present divergences between multicultural and feminist education and to the issue of feminist essentialism. King demonstrates in her own teaching what she calls "dysconscious racism," the taking of white norms of educational equality as givens. This chapter again connects to critical, liberatory pedagogy and raises important issues of race and ethnicity for education feminism.

Deanne Bogdan's chapter reaches . . . for interest in literature and connects education feminism to the important tradition of feminist literary criticism. Bogdan also works from Ellsworth and presents a story of her own teaching. The writings of Sandra Bartky, Robin Morgan, and Shoshana Felman are clearly influential here. The chapter closes the (classic section of the) book with a . . . reminder of the vivacity and diversity that now characterizes education feminism" (pp. 9–12).

### The Contemporary Frame

In the Contemporary Section, we begin with 1998 and carry the work forward to 2011. The scholars included are current feminist scholars, predominantly philosophers of education but not exclusively, and again the pool of scholars is a diverse group. We have maintained the same two basic themes; "Education and Schooling" and "Teaching and Pedagogy" and purposely selected essays that continue the conversation begun in the classics section, for example: Cris Mayo's and Barbara Thayer-Bacon's essays include Barbara Houston's earlier work from Stone's original text, as does Barbara Applebaum's essay, which includes Houston, Mayo, and Thompson. Tamara Beauboeuf-Lafontant brings Noddings' work forward in her essay on care theory, as well as Dill's and McKellar's work. Thompson's essay further engages Martin and Noddings on care theory. Some of the scholars in this contemporary section are responding to each other's scholarship as well. For example, Thayer-Bacon's essay includes a discussion of Laird's work on befriending girls, Applebaum's essay on resistance to White complicity includes a discussion of Mayo's and Thompson's work on moral agency, and Elenes refers to Delgado's work in her own Chicana feminist theory and pedagogy. All of the scholars included in the contemporary section are responding to criticisms of earlier feminist work in education and extending that work in diverse ways. Several of the essays, Mayo's, Thompson's, and Stone's & Grumet's, offer good, yet differing historical analyses of feminist scholarship which will help to give students historical overviews and frameworks to help position the new work.

All of the authors included in the new, contemporary collection of feminist work are excited and honored to be included with such a distinguished group of scholars. It has been so rewarding to have their responses of enthusiasm for the publication of *Education Feminism: Classic and Contemporary Readings*. We are eager to have the book in our hands for use in our classes.



## Contemporary

### Part I. *Education and Schooling*

- Cris Mayo, "Gender Disidentification: The Perils of the Post-Gender Condition" (2000)  
 Barbara Applebaum, "Situated Moral Agency: Why it Matters?" (2003)  
 Audrey Thompson, "Not the Color Purple: Black Feminist Lessons for Educational Caring" (1998)  
 Susan Laird, "Befriending Girls as an Educational Life-Practice" (2003)  
 Barbara J. Thayer-Bacon, "Befriending (White) Women Faculty in Higher Education?" (2011)  
 Huey-li Li, "Ecofeminism as a Pedagogical Project: Women, Nature, and Education" (2007)  
 C. Alejandra Elenes, "*Transformando Fronteras*: Chicana feminist transformative pedagogies" (2001)

### Part II. *Teaching and Pedagogy*

- Madeleine R. Grumet and Lynda Stone, "Feminism and Curriculum: Getting Our Act Together" (2000)  
 Tamara Beauboeuf-Lafontant, "A Womanist Experience of Caring: Understanding the Pedagogy of Exemplary Black Women Teachers" (2002)  
 Delores Delgado Bernal, "Critical Race Theory, Latino Critical Theory, and Critical Raced-Gendered Epistemologies: Recognizing Students of Color as Holders and Creators of Knowledge" (2002)  
 Heather Sykes, "Turning the Closets Inside/Out: Towards a Queer-Feminist Theory in Women's Physical Education" (1998)  
 Claudia Ruitenberg, "Queer Politics in Schools: A Rancièrian Reading" (2010)  
 Ann Chinnery, "Cold Case: Reopening the File on Tolerance in Teaching and Learning Across Difference" (2005)  
 Sharon Todd, "Unveiling Cross-Cultural Conflict: Gendered Cultural Practice in Polycultural Society" (2007)

## CHAPTER OVERVIEW

What follows is a brief description of each chapter, similar to what was included above for the Classics selections. In Part I we have again pulled together essays that take up schools and education as institutions within which gender matters. Within these eight essays we still find the themes of identity (and disidentity), multiple identities, subjectivity, complicity (and the denial of complicity), care theory further developed as well as troubled, the befriending of girls, and the horizontal violence girls and women do against

each other, especially in terms of whiteness. Perspectives include an Asian ecofeminist's critique of the women-nature affinity, and a Chicana feminist offering of critical raced-gendered epistemologies.

Cris Mayo's essay addresses the young women she teaches who deny a need to worry about gender-related bias and who agree with the media that feminism is dead. Her students "disidentify" with gender and perceive that they are living in "a post-gender world." Mayo argues that while these young women neither suffer from false consciousness nor achieve full transgression through their strategy of "disidentification," their refusal of gender identification fails to change how they are potentially perceived by others, potentially shuts down the conversation on identity, and most problematic, leaves them without a basis for solidarity.

Barbara Applebaum's essay explores the relationship between moral agency and social group location. Using Linda Alcoff's understanding of subjectivity in the sense of lived experience, and Iris Marion Young's notion of "gender as seriality," she outlines a notion of situatedness that elucidates the complex and mutual sustaining relationship between the individual and social structure. Her concept of situatedness explains how dominant group identities can unintentionally support oppressive social systems, and it also suggests a notion of agency that can account for the possibility of dominant group resistance. She then shows how these insights on self and moral agency can be applied to social justice pedagogy, using an example from Cris Mayo's work that advocates for a pedagogy of unknowing or of never knowing for certain.

Audrey Thompson's essay's follows Applebaum's where her work concerning whiteness is discussed, to help us better understand Thompson's emergent and critical approach. In this important essay for our collection, Thompson addresses care theory's "colorblindness" through an examination of Carol Gilligan's psychological theory on an ethic of care, and Nel Noddings and Jane Roland Martin's theories of caring in education. Because of their political and cultural assumptions, they are vulnerable to the charge of not only colorblindness, but also to charges of essentializing and feminizing care theory. She calls for a reexamination of the whiteness embedded in these colorblind theories, and shows how differently themes of these care theories are interpreted if a Black feminist perspective is assumed rather than a liberal White feminist perspective. Thompson seeks to call our attention to how we think about, develop, and implement an anti-racist curriculum and practice in classrooms.

Susan Laird seeks to conceptualize for educators what it might mean to "befriend girls" as an educational life-practice, with an illustration from the novel *Push*, by Sapphire, and Miz Blue Rain's relationship with the girls in her class. Following Iris Marion Young's lead, like Applebaum, Laird also conceives of women as a series and gender as seriality, "a dynamic structure that puts constraints on the modes and limits of people's actions." Her hope is that by theorizing on "this educational life-practice, *befriending girls* might be more widely acknowledged, valued, taught, learned, understood, undertaken, and critiqued—also much more aggressively financed."

Barbara Thayer-Bacon uses Laird's theorizing on *befriending girls*, as well as Paulo Freire's concept of *horizontal violence* to explore the chilly climate in higher education

that most women experience. Thayer-Bacon describes examples of what she perceives to be White women's horizontal violence against each other. Houston's earlier essay on gender bias in public schools and Pagano's essay on women in higher education feeling like plagiarists, as well as Martin's report of current conditions for women in higher education, help her with her analysis as she considers how to protect oneself from the horizontal violence while learning how to befriend women in higher education.

Huey-li Li's essay introduces us to ecofeminists' work, and their analyses of the woman-nature affinity, showing us that "ecofeminism sheds light on how gender ideology influences our worldview and the construction of educational institutions." Li focuses her ecofeminist analyses on the conception of "nature" within the environmental education movement, bringing a cross-cultural perspective to bear on Euro-western theories that link women with nature by contrasting this with China where nature has not historically been associated with woman. Li thus illustrates for us an important contribution feminist theory is making to the ecological justice movement and the establishment of new ethical norms in the global community.

C. Alejandra Elenes's essay on Chicana feminist transformative pedagogies extends the work of Joyce King from the classics section with her focus on finding ways in which women of color faculty can deal with their White women students' racism that exists in many contemporary educational settings. Based on Gloria Anzaldúa's concept of *mestiza consciousness*, border/transformational pedagogies propose ways in which teachers and students can enact a practice that tries to undo dualistic thinking. Through her self-reflective classroom observations and analysis of student evaluations, Elenes seeks to find ways to bring multiple ideologies and points of view to classroom discussion where productive discourse is enabled. The discussion also centers on the contradictions to the goals of democracy that are present in classrooms that seek to be liberatory.

In Part II of the Contemporary section, we again turn to theorizations of who teaches and how. Again, previous topics intersect in new ways: "questions of identity, conditions of education, theories of knowledge as they influence conceptions of teachers and teaching." Whereas the classics section offers papers that critique standard, nonfeminist theorizing, the authors in this section describe the limitations of feminism, in particular liberal feminism, and push us to embrace diversity and uncertainty. Our authors continue to represent diverse perspectives themselves in these seven essays.

Lynda Stone and Madeleine R. Grumet, both authors included in our classics section, start off this section with a collaborative essay written at the turn of the millennium that examines the possibilities of feminism and curriculum mutual influences. Stone and Grumet consider liberal feminism, which is the hierarchical, dualistic structure of gender that pervades western life, and its advances and limitations. They attend to dualisms as they connect to the history and theorizing of feminism, describing experiential, categorical, psychoanalytic, and deconstructive approaches. They argue that only formations that connect self and language, reproduction and representation will affect curriculum.

Tamara Beauboeuf-Lafontant's essay explores a particular form of caring exhibited in the pedagogy of exemplary black women teachers. In describing the characteristics of "womanist caring" that is an epistemological perspective based on the collective experiences

of black women, she describes teachers who embrace the maternal with political clarity and an ethic of risk. Beauboeuf-Lafontant provides historical and contemporary evidence to demonstrate that womanism is a long-standing tradition among African-American women teachers. She concludes with recommendations for better informing pre- and in-service educators.

Delores Delgado Bernal uses the work of earlier feminist standpoint epistemologies, such as Harding, Ladson-Billings' description of "systems of knowing," and the work of a number of education scholars talking about critical, raced, and raced-gendered epistemologies, such as Delgado Bernal, to demonstrate how Latino Critical Theory (LatCrit) and Critical Race Theory (CRT) provide an appropriate lens for qualitative research in the field of education. She looks at how different epistemological perspectives view students of color by comparing and contrasting a Eurocentric perspective and a specific raced-gendered perspective to show that they offer very different interpretations of the educational experiences of Chicana/Chicano students. Critical raced-gendered epistemology recognizes students of color as holders and creators of knowledge who have much to offer in transforming educational research and practice.

Heather Sykes's essay concerns women's physical education, furthering the Houston essay from our classics section, and also connecting in important ways to what Pagano developed in our classics section as well about teachers' identities. Sykes uses feminist and queer theories to explain why the closet has featured so prominently in women's physical education. She offers a poststructuralist analysis of how the closet was constructed in the life histories of six lesbian and heterosexual physical educators, and illustrates how silences inside the closet acquired meaning only in relation to everyday talk about heterosexuality. Sykes uses deconstruction to suggest how heterosexuality can sometimes find itself inside the closet, thus undermining the binaries inside/outside, silence/speech, and lesbian/heterosexual.

Claudia Ruitenberg uses examples of different school initiatives by and/or for queer students to explore the contested goals of perceptibility and intelligibility from the perspective of Jacques Rancière's conception of politics. She analyzes conditions of visibility and sayability and the political risks and benefits that these carry for queer students and teachers. Her essay brings Rancière's distinction between identification and subjectification into conversation with Judith Butler's work on the governing of intelligibility by social norms, and the promise of "insurrectionary speech." We learn that taking queer politics *qua politics* seriously in schools means not resting content with gaining permission to be visible and sayable in the existing school order, but, instead, seeking to change the "grid of legibility" of that existing order itself.

Ann Chinnery describes in her essay an undergraduate course on ethical issues in education in which she planned to show a video made by her of several local high school students' views on issues such as racism, sexism, homophobia, and class privilege, only to discover that one of the students she interviewed five years ago was now a student in her class. Added to the ethical dilemma of showing a video that would reveal the student's identity is the fact that the student expressed homophobic views in the interview not knowing that his current teacher (said interviewer) is a lesbian who clearly disagrees

with his position on the moral status of homosexuality. Chinnery shares with us how she modeled for her students, future teachers, how to handle such a situation; that we cannot abandon the attempt to communicate with our students, even across apparently incommensurable differences. In turning to *tolerance* for help, and foregrounding the student-teacher relationship through Noddings' care theory, she hopes to keep open the possibility of genuine moral dialogue somewhere in the future.

For our final essay in this section, Sharon Todd takes up the case of the right of Muslim girls and women to wear *hijab* to school as one of the most salient debates to emerge in the European context over the past fifteen years. Todd acknowledges the different shape the debate has taken in various countries across Europe, such as Sweden, Belgium, Germany, and France and yet "what is common to all these countries' ways of dealing with the educational rights of Muslims is the singling out of Muslim girls and women as symbols of deep tensions within their respective societies." Her aim is to highlight the nature of gender in developing a complex understanding of culture, and to propose a shift from describing society as multicultural (containing a variety of cultures) to polycultural (embodying cultural variety).

Just as Stone dedicated the original *The Education Feminism Reader* to the contributors of the book, we do the same again. As she said, "it is their book after all. Along with many others who presently labor for feminisms' ideas and practices in professional education, they (we) offer exemplars of this work as a beginning for enduring, transformative change" (p. 12). We do not want the earlier work to be lost to the social memory nor do we want it to appear as if feminist work is now complete. There is plenty of work that we continue to do; we truly are still continuing to work for what we hope will be enduring, transformative change.

## Notes

1. Stone, L. (Ed.), (1994). *The education feminism reader*. New York, London: Routledge.
2. Belenky, M., Clinchy, B., Goldberger, N., and Tarule, J. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing*. New York: Basic Books. Goldberger, N., Tarule, J., Clinchy, B., and Belenky, M. (Eds.), (1996). *Knowledge, Difference, and Power*. New York: BasicBooks, HarperCollins. Thayer-Bacon, B. (2003). *Relational "(e)pistemologies*." New York: Peter Lang.
3. Rich, A. (1979). Claiming an education, in *On lies, secrets, and silence*. New York: Norton.